#### Hydrodynamic Long-time Tails in Large-N Systems



#### **Navid Abbasi**

Gauge/Gravity Duality Nov-Dec 2024, Sanya

# 1. Outline

- Fluid mechanics
- Hydrodynamics
- Dynamical fluctuations
- Feedback on hydrodynamics
- Large N systems
- SK-EFT
- Prediction for non-causal diffusion  $\rightarrow$  experiment
- Prediction for causal diffusion  $\rightarrow$  experiment
- Why important?

## 2. Fluid mechanics!



• Dynamics:

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{grad})\mathbf{v} = -\frac{1}{\rho} \operatorname{grad} p + \frac{\eta}{\rho} \triangle \mathbf{v}.$$

[Euler, 1755]

[Navier, Stokes, 1822-1850]

## 2. Fluid mechanics!



[Navier, Stokes, 1822-1850]

•  $\ell_{mic} \ll a$ 

# 3. Hydrodynamics

Extend to more general systems:



#### [Xin An, Holotube]

In the limit:  $\ell_{mic} \ll L \rightarrow \ell_{mic} \ll a \ll L$ 

- QFT inside the box of size *a* is integrated out: "fluid cell"
- At scale *L*: dynamics of conserved densities  $\partial_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu}(x) = 0$

# 3. Hydrodynamics

Extend to more general systems:



[Xin An, Holotube]

In the limit:  $\ell_{mic} \ll L \rightarrow \ell_{mic} \ll a \ll L$ 

- QFT inside the box of size *a* is integrated out: "fluid cell"
- At scale L: dynamics of conserved densities  $\partial_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu}(x) = 0$  Hydrodynamics

# 4. Structure of $T^{\mu\nu}(x)$ in hydrodynamics

• From a microscopic viewpoint: (in scalar QFT)

 $\hat{T}^{00}(x) = \frac{1}{2} (\dot{\hat{\varphi}}(x))^2 + \frac{1}{2} (\nabla \hat{\varphi}(x))^2$ 

- In the hydrodynamic limit:
  - local equilibrium:

 $\rho_{eq}(x) = \frac{1}{Z} e^{\beta(x)P^{\mu}u_{\mu}(x)}$ 

- Dof  $T^{\mu 0}(x) = \langle \hat{T}^{\mu 0} \rangle$
- Stat-FT techniques:  $T^{\mu\nu}(x) = \text{Tr}\left(\rho_{eq}(x)\hat{T}^{\mu\nu}\right)$



# 4. Structure of $T^{\mu\nu}(x)$ in hydrodynamics

• From a microscopic viewpoint: (in scalar QFT)

 $\hat{T}^{00}(x) = \frac{1}{2} \left( \dot{\hat{\varphi}}(x) \right)^2 + \frac{1}{2} \left( \nabla \hat{\varphi}(x) \right)^2$ 

- In the hydrodynamic limit:
  - local equilibrium:

 $\rho_{eq}(x) = \frac{1}{Z} e^{\beta(x)P^{\mu}u_{\mu}(x)}$ 

• Dof  $T^{\mu 0}(x) = \langle \hat{T}^{\mu 0} \rangle$ 

• Stat-FT techniques:

$$T^{\mu\nu}(x) = \operatorname{Tr}\left(\rho_{eq}(x)\hat{T}^{\mu\nu}\right)$$
$$= \left(\epsilon(x) + p(x)\right)u^{\mu}(x)u^{\mu}(x) + \eta^{\mu\nu}p(x)$$



# **4.** Structure of $T^{\mu\nu}(x)$ in hydrodynamics

• From a microscopic viewpoint: (in scalar QFT)

 $\hat{T}^{00}(x) = \frac{1}{2} \left( \dot{\hat{\varphi}}(x) \right)^2 + \frac{1}{2} \left( \nabla \hat{\varphi}(x) \right)^2$ 

- In the hydrodynamic limit:
  - local equilibrium:

 $\rho_{eq}(x) = \frac{1}{Z} e^{\beta(x)P^{\mu}u_{\mu}(x)}$ 

• Dof  $T^{\mu 0}(x) = \langle \hat{T}^{\mu 0} \rangle$ 

• Stat-FT techniques:

ques: 
$$T^{\mu\nu}(x) = \operatorname{Tr}\left(\rho_{eq}(x)\hat{T}^{\mu\nu}\right)$$
$$= \left(\epsilon(x) + p(x)\right)u^{\mu}(x)u^{\mu}(x) + \eta^{\mu\nu}p(x)$$
$$\downarrow$$
scalar field theory : 
$$\epsilon(x) = 3 p(x) = \frac{\pi^2 T(x)^4}{30}$$



#### 5. Deviation from local equilibrium

- Local equilibrium  $\equiv$  leading term in the expansion over  $\varepsilon = \frac{\ell_{mic}}{L}$
- Out of Local equilibrium: **derivative expansion**:  $\varepsilon = \frac{\ell_{mic}}{L} \sim \ell_{mic} \partial$

$$\operatorname{Tr}\left[\left(\rho_{eq}(x) + \delta\rho(x)\right)\hat{T}^{\mu\nu}\right] = T^{\mu\nu}_{(0)} + T^{\mu\nu}_{(1)} + \mathcal{O}(\partial^{2})$$
  
ideal fluid viscous  
$$T^{\mu\nu}_{(1)} = -\eta\sigma^{\mu\nu}(x) - \xi\Delta^{\mu\nu}\partial_{\mu}u^{\mu}(x)$$

• Exp: In Scalar QFT:

$$\hat{T}^{00}(x) = \frac{1}{2} (\dot{\hat{\varphi}}(x))^2 + \frac{1}{2} (\nabla \hat{\varphi}(x))^2 + \frac{1}{4!} \lambda \, \hat{\varphi}(x)^4 \qquad \qquad \epsilon(x) = 3 \, p(x) = \frac{\pi^2 T(x)^4}{30} - \frac{\pi^2 \lambda}{16} \\ \eta(x) = a \frac{T(x)^3}{\lambda^2}, \quad \xi = 0$$

[Arnold, Moore, Yaffe JHEP (2000)] [Caron-Huot, Jeon, Moore PRL (2006)]

#### 5. Deviation from local equilibrium

- Local equilibrium  $\equiv$  leading term in the expansion over  $\varepsilon = \frac{\ell_{mic}}{L}$
- Out of Local equilibrium: **derivative expansion**:  $\varepsilon = \frac{\ell_{mic}}{I} \sim \ell_{mic} \partial$

$$\operatorname{Tr}\left[\left(\rho_{eq}(x) + \delta\rho(x)\right)\hat{T}^{\mu\nu}\right] = T^{\mu\nu}_{(0)} + T^{\mu\nu}_{(1)} + \mathcal{O}(\partial^{2})$$
  
ideal fluid  
$$\begin{aligned} \mathsf{viscous}\\ T^{\mu\nu}_{(1)} = -\eta\sigma^{\mu\nu}(x) - \xi\Delta^{\mu\nu}\partial_{\mu}u^{\mu}(x)\end{aligned}$$

• Exp: In Scalar QFT:

$$\hat{T}^{00}(x) = \frac{1}{2} (\dot{\hat{\varphi}}(x))^2 + \frac{1}{2} (\nabla \hat{\varphi}(x))^2 + \frac{1}{4!} \lambda \, \hat{\varphi}(x)^4 \qquad \qquad \epsilon(x) = 3 \, p(x) = \frac{\pi^2 T(x)^4}{30} - \frac{\pi^2 \lambda}{16} \\ \eta(x) = a \frac{T(x)^3}{\lambda^2}, \quad \xi = 0$$

[Arnold, Moore, Yaffe JHEP (2000)] [Caron-Huot, Jeon, Moore PRL (2006)]

So far dissipation; what about fluctuations?

## 6. Diffusion scale

• In the static background:

 $\langle H^2 \rangle - \langle H \rangle^2 = k_B T^2 C_V$  $\left\langle \delta \epsilon(\vec{x}_1) \, \delta \epsilon(\vec{x}_2) \right\rangle = k_B T^2 c_V \, \delta^3(\vec{x}_1 - \vec{x}_2)$ 

## 6. Diffusion scale

• In the static background:  $\langle H^2 \rangle - \langle H \rangle^2 = k_B T^2 C_V$ 

 $G(\vec{x}_1, \vec{x}_2) \equiv \left\langle \delta \epsilon(\vec{x}_1) \, \delta \epsilon(\vec{x}_2) \right\rangle = k_B T^2 c_V \, \delta^3(\vec{x}_1 - \vec{x}_2)$ 

## 6. Diffusion scale

- In the static background:  $\langle H^2 \rangle \langle H \rangle^2 = k_B T^2 C_V$  $G(\vec{x}_1, \vec{x}_2) \equiv \langle \delta \epsilon(\vec{x}_1) \, \delta \epsilon(\vec{x}_2) \rangle = k_B T^2 c_V \, \delta^3(\vec{x}_1 - \vec{x}_2)$
- In the hydro limit:
  - non-zero correlations

$$\tau_{ev} = \frac{L}{c_s} \xrightarrow{x \sim \sqrt{Dt}} \ell_{eq} \sim \sqrt{\frac{DL}{c_s}} \ll L$$



[An, Basar, Stephanov, Yee PRC (2019)]

Correlations find a finite width

$$G(\vec{x}_1, \vec{x}_2) \rightarrow G(t, \vec{x}_1, \vec{x}_2) \equiv G(t, \vec{x}, \vec{y})$$

The separation of scales suggests to work with:

$$\underbrace{\ell_{mic} \ll a \ll |\vec{y}| \ll L}_{k \ll q \ll \Lambda \ll \ell_{mic}^{-1}} G(x, \boldsymbol{y}) = \int \frac{d^3 q}{(2\pi)^3} G(x, \boldsymbol{q}) e^{i\boldsymbol{q} \cdot \boldsymbol{y}}$$

#### 7. Fluctuations dynamics

Equal-time correlators:

$$\left\langle \delta\phi_{a_1}(x)\delta\phi_{a_2}(x)\right\rangle = \int \frac{d^3k}{(2\pi)^3}G_{a_1a_2}(x,\boldsymbol{k})$$

hydrodynamic 2pt function

(hydrodynamic fluctuation)

- How equilibrate?
- Feedback on the flow?
- How large?
- How to calculate?



<sup>[</sup>Akamatsu, Mazeliauskas, Teaney PRC (2017)]

• Landau-Lifshitz idea:



Observables at large distances: averaged over noise

• Landau-Lifshitz idea:



- Observables at large distances: averaged over noise
- At linear order: no feedback; i.e.,  $\langle \breve{T}^{\mu\nu} \rangle = T^{\mu\nu}$

• Landau-Lifshitz idea:



- Observables at large distances: averaged over noise
- At linear order: no feedback; i.e.,  $\langle \breve{T}^{\mu\nu} \rangle = T^{\mu\nu}$
- At nonlinear order: e.g.,  $\langle \delta u^{\mu}(x) \delta u^{\nu}(x) \rangle$  contributes to  $\langle \breve{T}^{\mu\nu} \rangle$

• Landau-Lifshitz idea:



- Observables at large distances: averaged over noise
- At linear order: no feedback; i.e.,  $\langle \breve{T}^{\mu\nu} \rangle = T^{\mu\nu}$
- At nonlinear order: e.g.,  $\langle \delta u^{\mu}(x) \delta u^{\nu}(x) \rangle$  contributes to  $\langle \breve{T}^{\mu\nu} \rangle$
- Landau-Lifshitz focuses on linear order.

#### 9. Kinetic-hydro

- **FDT** Kinetic hydro for simple diffusion:  $\partial_t \, \breve{n} - D \nabla^2 \breve{n} = \, \theta$ ٠  $\begin{array}{ccc} & & & \\ & & \\ G_{nn}(t,\mathbf{k}) = \left\langle \delta n(t,\mathbf{k}) \delta n(t,-\mathbf{k}) \right\rangle \\ & & \\ & & \\ \end{array} \xrightarrow{} & & \\ \partial_t G_{nn}(t,\mathbf{k}) = -2D\mathbf{k}^2 \big( G_{nn} - \bar{G}_{nn} \big) \end{array}$
- Back reaction on J:
  - Stochastic current  $\breve{\mathbf{J}} = -(D_0 + D_1 \breve{n} + \cdots) \boldsymbol{\nabla} \breve{n}$
  - Averaged current: contains  $\int \frac{d^3k}{(2\pi)^3} G_{nn}(t, \mathbf{k})$





$$\left\langle \breve{\mathbf{J}} \right\rangle = \left( D_0 n + \mathcal{O}(\Lambda^3 T) + D_1 \chi \left( \frac{\omega}{D_0} \right)^{3/2} T \right) \mathbf{k}$$

#### 9. Kinetic-hydro

- Back reaction on **J**:
  - Stochastic current  $\breve{\mathbf{J}} = -(D_0 + D_1 \breve{n} + \cdots) \boldsymbol{\nabla} \breve{n}$
  - Averaged current: contains  $\int \frac{d^3k}{(2\pi)^3} G_{nn}(t, \mathbf{k})$



$$\left\langle \breve{\mathbf{J}} \right\rangle = \left( D_0 \, n + \mathcal{O}(\Lambda^3 T) + D_1 \chi \left(\frac{\omega}{D_0}\right)^{3/2} T \right) \mathbf{k}$$
  
**I**  
renormalization

#### 9. Kinetic-hydro

#### [Akamatsu, Mazeliauskas, Teaney PRC (2017)]

- Back reaction on **J**:
  - Stochastic current  $\breve{\mathbf{J}} = -(D_0 + D_1 \breve{n} + \cdots) \boldsymbol{\nabla} \breve{n}$
  - Averaged current: contains  $\int \frac{d^3k}{(2\pi)^3} G_{nn}(t, \mathbf{k})$





#### **10. Largeness of fluctuations**

• From our calculations

$$\left\langle \breve{\mathbf{J}} \right\rangle = \left( \begin{array}{c} D_0 \, n + \mathcal{O}(\Lambda^3 T) + \begin{array}{c} D_1 \chi \left(\frac{\omega}{D_0}\right)^{3/2} T \\ \mathcal{O}(\chi) \end{array} \right) \mathbf{k}$$

## **10. Largeness of fluctuations**

• From our calculations

$$\left\langle \breve{\mathbf{J}} \right\rangle = \left( \begin{array}{c} D_0 \, n + \mathcal{O}(\Lambda^3 T) + \begin{array}{c} D_1 \chi \left( \frac{\omega}{D_0} \right)^{3/2} T \\ \mathcal{O}(\chi) \end{array} \right) \mathbf{k}$$

The effect is suppressed by

$$\frac{1}{\chi} \sim \frac{1}{N} g^2$$

#### **10. Largeness of fluctuations**

• From our calculations

$$\left\langle \breve{\mathbf{J}} \right\rangle = \left( \begin{array}{c} D_0 \, n + \mathcal{O}(\Lambda^3 T) + \begin{array}{c} D_1 \chi \left(\frac{\omega}{D_0}\right)^{3/2} T \\ \mathcal{O}(\chi) \end{array} \right) \mathbf{k}$$

The effect is suppressed by

$$\frac{1}{\chi} \sim \frac{1}{N} \, g^2$$

- The effect of fluctuations should be small in
  - Weakly coupled systems
  - Strongly coupled systems at large N

- In holography, usually linear hydro is sufficient!
- Nonlinear effects are suppressed by  $\frac{1}{N^{\#}}$

[Saremi Caron-Huot JHEP 2009]

$${}^{(1)}G_{\rm R}^{xx}(\omega, k{=}0) \simeq \frac{T\Xi}{2w} (d{-}2) \Gamma(\frac{1-d}{2}) \left(\frac{-i\omega}{4\pi (D+\gamma_{\eta})}\right)^{\frac{d-1}{2}}$$





- In holography, usually linear hydro is sufficient!
- Nonlinear effects are suppressed by  $\frac{1}{N^{\#}}$

$${}^{(1)}G^{xx}_{
m R}(\omega,k{=}0) \simeq rac{T\Xi}{2w} (d{-}2)\Gamma(rac{1-d}{2}) \left(rac{-i\omega}{4\pi(D{+}\gamma_{\eta})}
ight)^{rac{d-1}{2}}$$







• The effect is perturbatively controlled at large N

- In holography, usually linear hydro is sufficient!
- Nonlinear effects are suppressed by  $\frac{1}{N^{\#}}$

[Saremi Caron-Huot JHEP 2009]

- The effect is perturbatively controlled at large N
- Systematically:

free EFT ~ linear hydro
interacting EFT ~ nonlinear effects in hydro
loop effect in EFT ~ longtime tail

- In holography, usually linear hydro is sufficient!
- Nonlinear effects are suppressed by  $\frac{1}{N^{\#}}$

[Saremi Caron-Huot JHEP 2009]



- The effect is perturbatively controlled at large N
- Systematically:

free EFT ~ linear hydro interacting EFT ~ nonlinear effects in hydro loop effect in EFT ~ longtime tail

• Towards Schwinger Keldysh EFT

# **12. SK-EFT**

- QFT at T = 0:  $\rho(-\infty) = |\Omega^-\rangle\langle\Omega^-|$  J(t)  $\gamma(+\infty) = |\Omega^+\rangle\langle\Omega^+|$
- QFT at *T* > 0:



**CTP** contour

- SK-EFT:
  - QFT on a CTP

$$\rho(-\infty) = e^{-\beta H} \quad \longleftarrow \quad \bullet$$

- Integrate out the fast modes
- Express the long wavelength limit by "conserved densities"
- In the simple case of diffusion:  $S_{EFT} \equiv S[n(x), \phi_a(x)]$
- $\langle n(x_1)n(x_2)\rangle$  and then  $G_{JJ}(x_1,x_2)$

[Crossley, Glorioso, Liu] [Jensen, Pinzani-Fokeeva, Yarom] [Heahl, Loganayagam, Rangamani]

t

- How to construct SK-Lagrangian:
  - Classical hydro equation = EoM
  - Symmetries of  $\rho(-\infty)$

## **13. Simple diffusion**

• Theory of diffusive fluctuations

[Chen-Lin, Delacretaz, Hartnoll, PRL (2019)]

$$\mathcal{L} = iT^{2}\kappa(\nabla\varphi_{a})^{2} - \varphi_{a}\left(\dot{n} - D\nabla^{2}n\right) + \nabla^{2}\varphi_{a}\left[\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{n}^{2} + \frac{1}{3}\lambda'n^{3}\right] + icT^{2}(\nabla\varphi_{a})^{2}\left[\tilde{\lambda}n + \tilde{\lambda}'n^{2}\right] + \cdots$$

• EoM at leading order:  $\partial_t n - D\nabla^2 n = 0$ 

$$\langle n\varphi_a \rangle_p = \frac{1}{\omega + iDk^2}$$

$$\langle nn \rangle_p = \frac{2T\chi Dk^2}{\omega^2 + (Dk^2)^2}$$

• EoM at sub-leading order:  $\partial_t n - D\nabla^2 n - \frac{1}{2}\lambda \nabla^2 n^2 = 0$ 



[NA, Kaminski, Tavakol PRL 2024]

#### 14. Precision test of SK-EFT

• Real time  $\langle n(x,t)n \rangle = \frac{\chi}{\sqrt{4\pi Dt}} \left[ F_{0,0}(y) + \frac{1}{\sqrt{t}} F_{1,0}(y) + O\left(\frac{\log t}{t}\right) \right] \qquad F_{0,0}(y) = e^{-y^2/4}$  $y \equiv x/\sqrt{Dt}$ 

Simulation results



## **15. Causal diffusion**

• A closed look 
$$\langle n(x,t)n \rangle = \frac{\chi}{\sqrt{4\pi Dt}} \left[ F_{0,0}(y) + \frac{1}{\sqrt{t}} F_{1,0}(y) + O\left(\frac{\log t}{t}\right) \right]$$
  $F_{0,0}(y) = e^{-y^2/4}$   
 $y \equiv x/\sqrt{Dt}$ 

[Michailidis, Abanin, Delacretaz PRX (2024)]

The spread of fluctuations is non-causal!

• Towards a causal theory of diffusion:

$$\mathbf{J} = -D\,\boldsymbol{\nabla}n \quad \underbrace{\partial_t n + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \mathbf{J} = 0}_{\partial_t n - D\boldsymbol{\nabla}^2 n = 0}$$

[Cattaneo, Atti Semin.Mat.Fis.Univ.Modena 3 (1948)] [Kadanoff, Martin, Annals of Physics (1963)]

## **15. Causal diffusion**

• A closed look 
$$\langle n(x,t)n \rangle = \frac{\chi}{\sqrt{4\pi Dt}} \left[ F_{0,0}(y) + \frac{1}{\sqrt{t}} F_{1,0}(y) + O\left(\frac{\log t}{t}\right) \right]$$
  $F_{0,0}(y) = e^{-y^2/4}$   
 $y \equiv x/\sqrt{Dt}$ 

[Michailidis, Abanin, Delacretaz PRX (2024)]

The spread of fluctuations is non-causal!

• Towards a causal theory of diffusion:

$$\tau \partial_t \mathbf{J} + \mathbf{J} = -D \, \boldsymbol{\nabla} n \quad \underbrace{\partial_t n + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \mathbf{J} = 0}_{t} \quad \boldsymbol{\nabla} \partial_t n + \partial_t n - D \, \boldsymbol{\nabla}^2 n = 0$$

[Cattaneo, Atti Semin.Mat.Fis.Univ.Modena 3 (1948)] [Kadanoff, Martin, Annals of Physics (1963)]

## **15. Causal diffusion**

• A closed look 
$$\langle n(x,t)n \rangle = \frac{\chi}{\sqrt{4\pi Dt}} \left[ F_{0,0}(y) + \frac{1}{\sqrt{t}} F_{1,0}(y) + O\left(\frac{\log t}{t}\right) \right]$$
  $F_{0,0}(y) = e^{-y^2/4}$   
 $y \equiv x/\sqrt{Dt}$ 

[Michailidis, Abanin, Delacretaz PRX (2024)]

The spread of fluctuations is non-causal!

• Towards a causal theory of diffusion:

$$\tau \partial_t \mathbf{J} + \mathbf{J} = -D \, \nabla n \quad \underbrace{\partial_t n + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{J} = 0}_{\tau \partial_t n} \quad \mathbf{\tau} \partial_t^2 n + \partial_t n - D \nabla^2 n = 0$$

[Cattaneo, Atti Semin.Mat.Fis.Univ.Modena 3 (1948)] [Kadanoff, Martin, Annals of Physics (1963)]

T (t)

А

**Experimental realization:** ۲



[Brown et al, Science, (2019) 1802.09456]

8

6

## **16. Fluctuations in Causal theory**

• SK-EFT for causal nonlinear diffusion

$$\mathcal{L} = iT\sigma(\boldsymbol{\nabla}n_a)^2 - n_a \left(\tau \partial_t^2 n + \partial_t n - D\boldsymbol{\nabla}^2 n\right) + iT\chi\lambda_\sigma n(\boldsymbol{\nabla}n_a)^2 + \frac{\lambda_D}{2} \boldsymbol{\nabla}^2 n_a n^2 + \frac{1}{2}iT\chi\lambda'_\sigma n^2(\boldsymbol{\nabla}n_a)^2 + \frac{\lambda'_D}{6} \boldsymbol{\nabla}^2 n_a n^3$$

$$G_{nn}^{R}(\omega, \mathbf{k}) = \frac{i \sigma \mathbf{k}^{2}}{-i(\tau + \delta \tau(\omega, \mathbf{k}))\omega^{2} + \omega + i(D + \delta D(\omega, \mathbf{k}))\mathbf{k}^{2}}$$

- Loop corrections
  - $\delta \tau(\omega, \mathbf{k}) = 0$ : consistent with fitting results





[NA, Kaminski, Tavakol PRL 2024]

#### 17. Condensed matter systems with large N

Hubbard model → Mott transitions ...

$$H = -t \sum_{\langle i,j \rangle,\sigma} (c^{\dagger}_{i\sigma}c_{j\sigma} + \text{h.c.}) + U \sum_{i} n_{i\uparrow}n_{i\downarrow}$$



• SYK model at large N  $\rightarrow$  quantum spin fluid

$$H = \frac{6}{N^3} \sum_{i < j < k < l} J_{ijkl} \chi_i \chi_j \chi_k \chi_l.$$



[Kobrin, Yang, Kahanamoku-Meyer, Olund, Moore, Stanford, Yao PRL (2021)]

# 18. Discussion

• We expect it works for a wider range time scales in large-N systems.

[NA, Kaminski, Tavakol PRL 2024]

- We expect the prediction of causal EFT to be applicable to a wider range of times scales. [NA, Kaminski, Tavakol PRL 2024]
- An interesting model to explore the "corrections": Holography. [Liu, Sun, Wu 2411.16306] [Baggioli, Bu, Ziogas JHEP (2023)] [Bu, Fujita, Lin JHEP (2021)]

#### Thank you for your attention!

- SK-EFT universally ties:
  - 1. Nonlinear response
  - 2. Corrections to linear response
  - 3. Dependence of D on experimental tuning parameter n:  $D_1 = \frac{dD}{dn}$



