### A few highlights of light QCD exotics

### 刘北江

#### 中国科学院高能物理研究所

第六届强子谱和强子结构研讨会,北京

## Hadrons

- Hadrons: complex building block of the visible universe
- Emergence of hadron structure
  - How are hadrons formed from quarks?
  - What is the origin of confinement?
  - How is the mass of hadron generated in QCD?
  - What is the dynamics of effective DoF in hadrons?





#### **QCD** exotics: configurations beyond QM

### Hadron spectroscopy

- How does QCD give rise to hadrons?
  - Quark model seems to work really well. Why?
- Key things to search for: additional degree of freedom
  - Strong evidences for multi-quark in heavy quark sector
     Strong evidences for multi-quark in heavy quark sector
     *https://qwg.ph.nat.tum.de/exoticshub/*
  - Evidence for gluonic excitations remains sparse

#### • Role of gluons:

- Gluons mediate the strong force
- Hadron constituent: Mass? Quantum numbers? ...
- Gluons' unique self-interacting property
  - → New form of matter: glueballs, hybrids
- Gluonic Excitations provide measurements of the QCD potential

**Critical to confinement and mass dynamical generation** 



#### **Light QCD exotics**

### QCD exotics

- How to identify:
- Manifestly exotic
  - Flavor exotic
  - Spin exotic:  $J^{PC} = 0^{--}$ ,  $even^{+-}$ ,  $odd^{-+}$
- Crypto exotic
  - Supernumerary states
  - Abnormal properties
- + kinematics





### Synergies in new era of precision spectroscopy

- From serendipitous discoveries of new states to the systematic study of spectral properties and patterns
- High statistics → emergence of new properties/phenomena
- Test QCD with various probes



**Beijing Electron Positron Collider (BEPCII)** 





#### Charmonium decays provide an ideal lab for light QCD exotics

- Clean high statistics data samples High cross sections of  $e^+e^- \rightarrow J/\psi$ ,  $\psi'$ Low background
- Well defined initial and final states Kinematic constraints I(J<sup>PC</sup>) filter
- "Gluon-rich" process

- Glueballs
- Spin-exotic states
- Threshold structures & multi-quark states

### Glueballs

- Low-lying glueballs with ordinary J<sup>PC</sup>
- $\rightarrow$  mixing with  $q\overline{q}$  mesons
  - →Observe a new peak

Challenge: reveal the exotic admixture

- Model-dependent predictions
  - mass, width, partial width

#### • Non- $q\overline{q}$ nature difficult to be established

- Supernumerary states
- Unusual pattern of production and decay
   *'Cryptoexotic'*



Glueballs from Lattice simulations in the pure gauge theory without quarks

### What we have learned before

-- from MarkIII, BES, Crystal barrel, OBELIX, WA102, GAMS, E852, ...

#### Scalar: 1 nonet in quark model, $f_0 \& f_0'$

Exp: overpopulation

LQCD : ground state 0<sup>+</sup> glueball ~1.7 GeV;  $\Gamma(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma G_{0+})/\Gamma_{total} = 3.8(9) \times 10^{-3}$  **Tensor: 2 nonets(**<sup>3</sup>P<sub>2</sub>, <sup>3</sup>F<sub>2</sub>), complicated Exp: large uncertainty LQCD: 2<sup>++</sup>(2.3~2.4 GeV);  $\Gamma(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma G_{2+})/\Gamma_{total} = 1.1(2) \times 10^{-2}$ 

#### Pseudoscalar: $\eta \& \eta'$ , "simple"

Exp: lacking of info. above 2 GeV; puzzles  $\eta(1295)$ ?  $\eta(1405/1475)$ ?

LQCD:  $0^{-+}(2.3 \sim 2.6 \text{ GeV})$  $\Gamma(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma G_{0-})/\Gamma_{total} = 2.31(80) \times 10^{-4}$ 



e<sup>+</sup>e<sup>-</sup> annihilation pp annihilation central exclusive production charge-exchange reactions

## $f_0(1370), f_0(1500), f_0(1710)$

### Scalar glueball candidate: production properties

- Scalar glueball is expected to have a large production in  $J/\psi$  radiative decays:
  - LQCD:  $\Gamma(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma G_{0+})/\Gamma_{total} = 3.8(9) \times 10^{-3}$
  - Observed  $B(J/\psi \to \gamma f_0(1710))$  is x10 larger than  $f_0(1500)$
  - >BESIII:  $f_0(1710)$  largely overlapped with scalar glueball



# Phenomenology studies of coupled channel analysis with BESIII results

Scalar isoscalar mesons and the scalar glueball from radiative  $J/\psi$  decays

A.V. Sarantsev<sup>a,b</sup>, I. Denisenko<sup>c</sup>, U. Thoma<sup>a</sup>, and E. Klempt<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Helmholtz–Institut für Strahlen– und Kernphysik, Universität Bonn, Germany <sup>b</sup>NRC "Kurchatov Institute", PNPI, Gatchina 188300, Russia <sup>c</sup>Joint Institute for Nuclear Research, Joliot-Curie 6, 141980 Dubna, Moscow region, Russia

#### Abstract

A coupled-channel analysis of BESIII data on radiative  $J/\psi$  decays into  $\pi\pi$ ,  $K\bar{K}$ ,  $\eta\eta$  and  $\omega\phi$  has been performed. The partial-wave amplitude is constrained by a large number of further data. The analysis finds ten isoscalar scalar mesons. Their masses, widths and decay modes are determined. The scalar mesons are interpreted as mainly SU(3)-singlet and mainly octet states. Octet isoscalar scalar states are observed with significant yields only in the 1500-2100 MeV mass region. Singlet scalar mesons are produced over a wide mass range but their yield peaks in the same mass region. The peak is interpreted as scalar glueball. Its mass and width are determined to  $M = 1865\pm25^{+10}_{-10}$  MeV and  $\Gamma = 370\pm50^{+30}_{-20}$  MeV, its yield in radiative  $J/\psi$  decays to  $(5.8 \pm 1.0)$  10<sup>-3</sup>.

#### Phys.Lett.B 816, 136227 (2021)

#### Scalar and tensor resonances in $J/\psi$ radiative decays

A. Rodas,<sup>1, 2, \*</sup> A. Pilloni,<sup>3, 4, 5, †</sup> M. Albaladejo,<sup>6</sup> C. Fernández-Ramírez,<sup>7</sup> V. Mathieu,<sup>8, 9</sup> and A. P. Szczepaniak<sup>2, 10, 11</sup> (Joint Physics Analysis Center)

<sup>1</sup>Department of Physics, College of William and Mary, Williamsburg, VA 23187, USA <sup>2</sup>Theory Center, Thomas Jefferson National Accelerator Facility, Newport News, VA 23606, USA <sup>3</sup>INFN Sezione di Roma, I-00185 Roma, Italy <sup>4</sup>Dipartimento di Scienze Matematiche e Informatiche, Scienze Fisiche e Scienze della Terra, Università degli Studi di Messina, I-98166 Messina, Italy <sup>5</sup>INFN Sezione di Catania, I-95123 Catania, Italy <sup>6</sup>Instituto de Física Corpuscular (IFIC), Centro Mizto CSIC-Universidad de Valencia, Institutos de Investigación de Paterna, Aptd. 22085, E-46071 Valencia, Spain <sup>7</sup>Instituto de Ciencias Nucleares, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Ciudad de México 04510, Mexico <sup>8</sup>Departament de Física Quàntica i Astrofísica and Institut de Ciències del Cosmos, Universitat de Barcelona, E08028, Spain <sup>9</sup>Departamento de Física Teórica, Universidad Complutense de Madrid and IPARCOS, E-28040 Madrid, Spain <sup>10</sup>Physics Department, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405, USA <sup>11</sup>Center for Exploration of Energy and Matter, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47403, USA

> We perform a systematic analysis of the  $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \pi^0 \pi^0$  and  $\rightarrow \gamma K_S^0 K_S^0$  partial waves measured by BESIII. We use a large set of amplitude parametrizations to reduce the model bias. We determine the physical properties of seven scalar and tensor resonances in the 1–2.5 GeV mass range. These include the well known  $f_0(1500)$  and  $f_0(1710)$ , that are considered to be the primary glueball candidates. The hierarchy of resonance couplings determined from this analysis favors the latter as the one with the largest glueball component.

#### Eur.Phys.J.C 82, 80 (2022)

#### $f_0(1710)$ largely overlapped with scalar glueball



### Tensor glueball candidate

 $egin{aligned} \Gamma(J/\psi o \gamma G_{2^+}) &= 1.01(22) keV \ \Gamma(J/\psi o \gamma G_{2^+})/\Gamma_{tot} &= 1.1 imes 10^{-2} \end{aligned}$ 

CLQCD, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 091601 (2013)

#### Experimental results

 $\begin{array}{l} Br(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_2(2340) \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta) = \left(3.8^{+0.62+2.37}_{-0.65-2.07}\right) \times 10^{-5} \\ \text{BESIII PRD 87,092009 (2013)} \end{array}$   $\begin{array}{l} Br(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_2(2340) \rightarrow \gamma \varphi \varphi) = \left(1.91 \pm 0.14^{+0.72}_{-0.73}\right) \times 10^{-4} \\ \text{BESIII PRD 93, 112011 (2016)} \end{array}$   $\begin{array}{l} Br(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_2(2340) \rightarrow \gamma K_s K_s) = \left(5.54^{+0.34+3.82}_{-0.40-1.49}\right) \times 10^{-5} \\ \text{BESIII PRD 98,072003 (2018)} \end{array}$   $\begin{array}{l} Br(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_2(2340) \rightarrow \gamma \eta' \eta') = \left(8.67 \pm 0.70^{+0.16}_{-1.67}\right) \times 10^{-6} \end{array}$ 

BESIII PRD 105,072002 (2022)

BESIII  $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \phi \phi$  with 1.3B  $J/\psi$ 



It is desirable to search for more decay modes

### Pseudoscalars



Where is the 0<sup>-+</sup> glueball

- LQCD: 0<sup>-+</sup>(2.3~2.6 GeV)
- Does  $\eta(1295)$  exist?
- What' s the nature of the outnumbered  $\eta(1405)$ ?



Long standing E- $\iota$  puzzle  $M = 1416 \pm 8^{+7}_{-5}; \Gamma = 91^{+67}_{-31-38} + 15 \text{ MeV}/c^2$  $M = 1490^{+14+3}_{-8-6}; \Gamma = 54^{+37+13}_{-21-24} \text{ MeV}/c^2$ 

### Isospin-violating decay of $\eta(1405) \rightarrow f_0(980)\pi^0$



π

π

### $\eta(1405)/\eta(1475)$ puzzle

#### BESIII PRL 108 182001(2012)

Inspired by **BESIII**'s observation, the triangle singularity mechanism has been proposed

• Manifested in many near-threshold structures



### X(2370)

Events/(0.01GeV/c<sup>2</sup>)

Events/(0.01GeV/c<sup>2</sup>)



### Landscape of glueballs has been updated with BESIII' s inputs

Scalar: 1 nonet in quark	<b>model,</b> f <sub>0</sub> & f <sub>0</sub>
--------------------------	---

Exp: overpopulation

LQCD : ground state 0<sup>+</sup> glueball ~1.7 GeV;

 $\Gamma(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma G_{0+})/\Gamma_{total} = 3.8(9) \times 10^{-3}$ 

Tensor: 2 nonets(<sup>3</sup>P<sub>2</sub>, <sup>3</sup>F<sub>2</sub>), complicated

Exp: large uncertainty LQCD:  $2^{++}(2.3 \sim 2.4 \text{ GeV});$  $\Gamma(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma G_{2+})/\Gamma_{total} = 1.1(2) \times 10^{-2}$ 

#### Pseudoscalar: $\eta \& \eta'$ , "simple"

Exp: lacking of info. above 2 GeV; puzzles η(1295)? η(1405/1475)?

LQCD:  $0^{-+}(2.3 \sim 2.6 \text{ GeV})$  $\Gamma(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma G_{0-})/\Gamma_{total} = 2.31(80) \times 10^{-4}$  ✓ Large production rate of  $f_0(1710)$  in J/ $\psi$  radiative decays

✓ Large production rate of  $f_2(2340)$  in J/ $\psi$  radiative decays

 $\checkmark Non-observation of \eta(1295)$ 

√η(1405/1475) one state?→
 manifestations of TS

 $\checkmark X(2370) \rightarrow$  various decay modes

- Glueballs
- Spin-exotic states
- Threshold structures & multi-quark states

### Light hadrons with exotic quantum numbers

- Unambiguous signature for exotics
  - Light Flavor-exotic hard to establish
  - Efforts concentrate on Spin-exotic
    - Forbidden for  $q\overline{q}$ :

 $J^{PC} = 0^{--}, even^{+-}, odd^{-+}$ 

**Experiments:** 

- Hadroproduction: E852, VES, COMPASS, GAMS
- pp annihilation: Crystal Barrel, OBELIX, PANDA(under construction)
- Photoproduction: GlueX(2017-), CLAS



### Spin-exotic mesons

- Only 3 candidates so far: All 1<sup>-+</sup> isovectors
  - $\pi_1(1400)$  : seen in  $\eta\pi$
  - $\pi_1(1600)$  : seen in  $\rho\pi$ ,  $\eta'\pi$ ,  $b_1\pi$ ,  $f_1\pi$
  - $\pi_1(2015)$  (needs confirmation): seen in  $b_1\pi$ , and  $f_1\pi$
- Some claims are controversial
- $\pi_1(1400) \& \pi_1(1600)$  can be explained as one pole



Detailed reviews: PRC 82, 025208 (2010), PPNP 82, 21 (2015)				
$\pi_{beam} \xrightarrow{X} h_1 \qquad \overline{p} \xrightarrow{X} h_1 \\ \vdots \\ h_n \\ Target \qquad Recoil \qquad \qquad$				
	Decay mode	Reaction	Experiment	
π <sub>1</sub> (1400)	ηπ	$\pi^- p  ightarrow \pi^- \eta p$ $\pi^- p  ightarrow \pi^0 \eta n$ $\pi^- p  ightarrow \pi^- \eta p$ $\pi^- p  ightarrow \pi^0 \eta n$ $\bar{p}n  ightarrow \pi^- \pi^0 \eta$ $\bar{p}p  ightarrow \pi^0 \pi^0 \eta$	GAMS KEK E852 E852 CBAR CBAR	
	$ ho\pi$	$\bar{p}p \rightarrow 2\pi^+ 2\pi^-$	Obelix	
π <sub>1</sub> (1600)	η΄π	$ \begin{array}{c} \pi^{-}Be \rightarrow \eta' \pi^{-} \pi^{0}Be \\ \pi^{-}p \rightarrow \pi^{-} \eta' p \end{array} $	VES E852	
	$b_1\pi$	$ \begin{aligned} \pi^{-}Be &\to \omega \pi^{-} \pi^{0}Be \\ \bar{p}p &\to \omega \pi^{+} \pi^{-} \pi^{0} \\ \pi^{-}p &\to \omega \pi^{-} \pi^{0}p \end{aligned} $	VES CBAR E582	
	ρπ	$\pi^{-}Pb \rightarrow \pi^{+}\pi^{-}\pi^{-}X$ $\pi^{-}p \rightarrow \pi^{+}\pi^{-}\pi^{-}p$	COMPASS E582	
	$f_1\pi$	$\pi^- p \rightarrow p\eta \pi^+ \pi^- \pi^-$ $\pi^- A \rightarrow \eta \pi^+ \pi^- \pi^- A$	E582 VES	
π <sub>1</sub> (2015)	$f_1\pi$ $b_1\pi$	$\pi^- p \rightarrow \omega \pi^- \pi^0 p$ $\pi^- p \rightarrow p \eta \pi^+ \pi^- \pi^-$	E582	

### Hybrid from LQCD



Decay width of 1<sup>-+</sup> hybrid

Lightest spin-exotic state: 1<sup>-+</sup>

1<sup>-+</sup> Hybrids

- Isoscalar 1<sup>-+</sup> is critical to establish the hybrid nonet
  - Can be produced in the gluon-rich charmonium decays
  - Can decay to  $\eta\eta'$  in P-wave

PRD 83,014021 (2011), PRD 83,014006 (2011), EP.J.P 135, 945(2020)

 $\rightarrow$  Search for η<sub>1</sub> (1<sup>-+</sup>) in J/ψ  $\rightarrow$  γηη'

 $\pi_{1} I^{G}(J^{PC}) = 1^{-}(1^{-+})$   $K_{1} I^{G}(J^{P}) = \frac{1}{2}^{-}(1^{-})$   $\eta_{1} I^{G}(J^{PC}) = 0^{+}(1^{-+})$ 



### Observation of An Exotic $1^{-+}$ Isoscalar State $\eta_1(1855)$

PRL 129 192002(2022), PRD 106 072012(2022)

- An isoscalar  $1^{-+}$ ,  $\eta_1(1855)$ , has been observed in  $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta'$  (>19 $\sigma$ )  $M = (1855 \pm 9^{+6}_{-1}) \text{ MeV/c}^2$ ,  $\Gamma = (188 \pm 18^{+3}_{-8}) \text{ MeV/c}^2$  $B(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta_1(1855) \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta') = (2.70 \pm 0.41^{+0.16}_{-0.35}) \times 10^{-6}$ 
  - Mass consistent with hybrid on LQCD
- Inspired many interpretations: Hybrid/KK<sub>1</sub>Molecule/Tetraquark?
- Further more, suppression of  $f_0(1710) \to \eta \eta'$  supports it has a large overlap with glueball

#### **Opens a new direction to completing the picture of spin-exotics** 24



#### Observation of An Exotic 1<sup>-+</sup> Isoscalar State $\eta_1(1855)$

- **Opens a new direction to completing the picture of spin-exotics**
- LQCD:  $B(J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta_1(hybrid)) \sim O(10^{-5})$ [Phys.Rev.D 107 (2023) 5, 054511]
- Inspired many interpretations: Hybrid/KK<sub>1</sub>Molecule/Tetraquark?
- Uniqueness, enrichment and complementary
  - High statistics gluon-rich environment: 10 B J/ $\psi$ , 2.7 B  $\psi'$ , a lot of  $\chi_{cJ}$
  - BESIII is not only a good lab for glueball, but also for light spin-exotics

25

•  $\pi_1$ ,  $\eta_1^{(\prime)}$ , and other partners



### $\pi_1(1600)$ upper limits and projections to $\pi\eta$ , $\pi\eta'$



- Glueballs
- Spin-exotic states
- Threshold structures & multi-quark states

### $a_0(980) - f_0(980)$ mixing

• The nature of ground state scalar  $a_0(980)$  • First and  $f_0(980)$  are controversial

KK molecules, 'oldest' tetraquarks, hybrids,...?

•  $a_0(980) - f_0(980)$  mixing is an important probe to the internal structure of  $a_0(980)$ and  $f_0(980)$ 



• First direct measurement with >  $5\sigma$ 



BESIII PRL 121 022001

### Explore light hadrons with charmed meson decays



### Structures around pp threshold



### Narrow structure in $p\overline{\Lambda}$



 Different scenarios investigated: baryonium state [PRD74,014029], baryon-antibaryon SU(3) nonets [PLB626,95], final state interaction [IJMPA22,5401], ...

### $e^+e^- \rightarrow pK^-\overline{\Lambda}$

8

 $M_{pK}^{2}(GeV^{2}/c^{4})$ 

**10** 

 $M^{2}_{\overline{\Lambda K}}$ .(GeV<sup>2</sup>/c<sup>4</sup>)

arXiv:2303.01989

6 different center of mass energies between 4.008 GeV to 4.682 GeV

• Significant near threshold enhancement in the  $p\overline{\Lambda}$ 

• X(2085):

30

25

20

15

10

- observed with statistical significance  $> 20\sigma$
- $J^P = 1^+$  with statistical significance > 5 $\sigma$  over other quantum numbers

 $M_{pole} = (2086 \pm 4 \pm 6) \,\mathrm{MeV}$   $\Gamma_{pole} = (56 \pm 5 \pm 16) \,\mathrm{MeV}$ 

- No matching with any state predicted by the potential model + narrow width  $\rightarrow$  exotic properties of X(2085)
- Same structure as in PRL93, 112002 ?



### Summary

- Understanding how hadron spectroscopy are emerged from QCD remains a key question in fundamental physics, which requires
  - both heavy and light sectors
  - Complementary experimental information
- Critical collaboration with theory
  - Reaction models
  - Theoretical constraints



Thank you for your attention